

August 2020

# Grading our Leaders:

Respect for the constitution  
during the COVID-19 crisis



CANADIAN  
CONSTITUTION  
FOUNDATION

# Contents

<a href="#">Table of contents</a> .....	2
<a href="#">About the CCF</a> .....	3
<a href="#">Executive Summary</a> .....	4
<a href="#">Ranks: from best to worst</a> .....	5
<a href="#">Brian Pallister</a> .....	6
<a href="#">Jason Kenney</a> .....	7
<a href="#">John Horgan</a> .....	8
<a href="#">Doug Ford</a> .....	9
<a href="#">Stephen McNeil</a> .....	10
<a href="#">Francois Legault</a> .....	11
<a href="#">Scott Moe</a> .....	12
<a href="#">Blaine Higgs</a> .....	13
<a href="#">Dennis King</a> .....	14
<a href="#">Dwight Ball</a> .....	15
<a href="#">Justin Trudeau</a> .....	16
<a href="#">How local leaders did</a> .....	17



# CANADIAN CONSTITUTION FOUNDATION

The Canadian Constitution Foundation (CCF) is a registered charity, independent and non-partisan. We defend the constitutional rights and freedoms of Canadians in the courts of law and public opinion.

The Canadian Constitution Foundation thanks the scholars who assisted us in grading the premiers and the prime minister on respect for the constitution during the COVID-19 crisis: Emmett Macfarlane (University of Waterloo); Kerri Froc (University of New Brunswick); Camden Hutchison (University of British Columbia), Gerard Kennedy (University of Manitoba) and Lyle Skinner (Ottawa).

This report was written by **Josh Dehaas** (CCF Law Intern), **Joanna Baron** (CCF Executive Director) & **Christine Van Geyn** (CCF Litigation Director).

Phone: 1.888.695.9105

Email: [info@theccf.ca](mailto:info@theccf.ca)

Canadian Constitution Foundation  
6025—12 St SE, Suite 215  
Calgary, AB T2H 2K1

Charitable Number: 86617 6654 RR0001

The CCF is also a 501(c)(3) public charity in the U.S.

Cover photo by [Chris Slothouber](#) and used under [CC 2.0](#).

# Executive Summary

In January, the World Health Organization confirmed the existence of a concerning cluster of respiratory infections in Wuhan. Ten weeks later, Canadians were stockpiling toilet paper and watching in horror as thousands of Italians struggled to breathe. Ottawa closed the U.S.-Canada border to non-essential travel and dismissed parliament. The premiers shut schools and pleaded with the public to stay home. By April, governments had imposed more severe restrictions on liberty than most Canadians had ever expected to endure. Swift action saved lives, but some first ministers showed a disturbing lack of respect for Canada's supreme law in the process.

The Canadian Constitution Foundation defends constitutional freedoms, so we felt it was our duty to speak out when COVID-19-related restrictions went too far. We advocated against using cellphone data to track patients, illegal provincial border closures, decrees that shut down businesses arbitrarily and attempts by premiers to cast aside democratic requirements. We pushed back against excessive face-covering bylaws, prompting changes to a major Ontario health unit's unconstitutional order.

Constitutional precedents are forged during emergencies, so it is essential that we hold Canada's premiers and prime minister accountable during this unusual time. That is why we gathered some of Canada's top legal minds together to help us create this report card for Canada's executive leaders. We focused on how well they respected six dimensions of constitutional norms: Democracy & Rule of Law; Freedom of Religion & Conscience; Freedom of Assembly & Speech; Mobility Rights; Life, Liberty & Security of the Person Rights; and Privacy Rights. "A" grades were assigned to premiers who took proactive steps to protect the constitution, such as making clear that group size limits could not prevent people from exercising their rights to free expression and assembly. "F" grades were assigned to those who showed disdain for constitutional norms, for example by putting up roadblocks to keep fellow Canadians out. Grades were adjusted for consistency across the entire class of leaders. Grade averages were calculated by equally weighting the six letter grades.

No leader got all As, but some did better than others. Top marks in our report go to Saskatchewan's Scott Moe and Manitoba Premier Brian Pallister, who both did well at protecting most freedoms, but didn't show enough respect for Democracy & Rule of Law. Newfoundland and Labrador Premier Dwight Ball, who has since left office, ranks at the very bottom of the class with straight Fs. In general, Western Canada's premiers did well and Atlantic Canada's premiers did poorly. Party affiliation didn't seem to predict who did well. Prime Minister Trudeau landed right in the middle.

The Canadian Constitution Foundation will continue to be there to make sure our constitutional freedoms are protected until this storm has passed. Thank you for your support.

# Ranks: from best to worst



Manitoba Premier Brian Pallister	<b>B</b>
Saskatchewan Premier Scott Moe	<b>B</b>
British Columbia Premier John Horgan	<b>B-</b>
Alberta Premier Jason Kenney	<b>B-</b>
Prime Minister Justin Trudeau	<b>C+</b>
Ontario Premier Doug Ford	<b>C</b>
New Brunswick Premier Blaine Higgs	<b>C-</b>
Nova Scotia Premier Stephen McNeil	<b>D+</b>
Quebec Premier Francois Legault	<b>D</b>
Prince Edward Island Premier Dennis King	<b>D</b>
Newfoundland & Labrador Premier Dwight Ball	<b>F</b>

---

# Brian Pallister

## Manitoba



Image: By [USDA](#) (PD)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **C**

Assembly & Speech: **A**

Mobility Rights: **B**

Life, Liberty & Security: **A**

Privacy Rights: **A**

**Grade Average: B**

### Tied with Saskatchewan's premier for highest overall grade

Manitoba's Progressive Conservative premier tied with Saskatchewan's premier for the highest average grade. Pallister gets an A on the dimension of Life, Liberty & Security. That's because he ensured that elective surgeries cancelled in March were nearly all rebooked by June, and he resisted the urge to restrict liberty by closing parks.

Pallister also showed respect for freedom of assembly and speech. He relaxed the limit on outdoor gatherings from 10 people to 50 people on May 22, making it easier for people to assemble and exercise their right to free expression. Pallister deserves praise for his response to a question about an anti-racism protest that exceeded 50 people: he called free speech a "a powerful and important right in a free society."

Pallister also gets a decent grade in Mobility Rights. Unlike his Atlantic Canadian counterparts, Pallister did not bar fellow Canadians from entering. Instead, he required entrants to self-isolate for 14 days, and this

rule did not apply to those living within 50 kilometres of the border. Pallister lifted these restrictions on June 21 for all Canadians living west of Nipigon, Ont.

On Religion & Conscience, Pallister could have been less restrictive. Places of worship were only allowed to host 10 people at a time for months, even if they could properly enforce physical distancing, and low-risk parking lot services were not allowed until June.

Pallister's only poor grade is in Democracy & Rule of Law. Although he did not attempt to give the executive undue powers during the crisis like some premiers, the legislature sat only five times between mid-March and July, making it difficult for the opposition to perform its constitutional function. Pallister was also seen flouting the mandatory mask requirement at Toronto Pearson International Airport, which gave the impression he felt he was above the rules.



---

# Jason Kenney

## Alberta



Image: By Andrew Scheer (PD)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **A**

Assembly & Speech: **C**

Mobility Rights: **A**

Life, Liberty & Security: **C**

Privacy Rights: **B**

**Grade Average: B-**

### Good overall but weak on Democracy & Rule of Law

Alberta's United Conservative Party premier has a mixed report card. Kenney's government lost major points on Democracy & Rule of Law because of Bill 10. This rushed law created a constitutionally-suspect Henry VIII clause, which allows a single minister to exercise the lawmaking power of all of parliament. This power can continue for up to six months after the end of the emergency making it even more concerning. The only reason he does not get an F is that the legislature continued to meet.

Kenney gets a middling grade on Life, Liberty & Security. He rushed through Bill 13, which unnecessarily threatens the liberty of those who violate the *Emergency Measures Act* by providing for up to a year in prison for violating travel restrictions in the province, price fixing or refusing to render expert aid, and also increases the maximum penalty for disobeying the *Public Health Act* from \$2,000 to a ruinous \$100,000 for the first offence.

Kenney lost points on Privacy Rights because he failed to explain how information obtained through a COVID-19 contract tracing app would be used and encouraged places of worship to keep lists of those who attend.

On Assembly & Speech, Kenney gets another middling grade. When a COVID-19 protester was arrested while protesting the lockdown, Kenney rightly denounced the arrest and said he expected law enforcement to "exercise common sense in respecting both fundamental rights and protecting public health." That said, he also pushed ahead with the *Critical Infrastructure Defence Act*, which could chill free speech.

Kenney gets an A on Mobility Rights: he put up no unconstitutional roadblocks. He also gets top marks in Religion & Conscience. Kenney allowed religious services to host up to 50 people, even as other indoor gatherings were still limited to 15. Overall, he gets a B-.

---

# John Horgan

## British Columbia



Image: By [BC NDP](#) & modified ([CC 2.0](#))

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**  
Religion & Conscience: **B**  
Assembly & Speech: **A**  
Mobility Rights: **C**  
Life, Liberty & Security: **C**  
Privacy Rights: **A**

**Grade Average: B-**

### Good overall but weak on Democracy & Rule of Law

British Columbia's New Democratic premier did better than most at protecting rights and freedoms, but his government's hypocritical stance on independent healthcare and his sidelining of the legislature led to a couple of lower marks.

Horgan deserves credit for continuing to allow gatherings of up to 50 people throughout the crisis, which was a more proportionate response than many premiers who faced similarly low levels of COVID-19 but decided to ban gatherings of more than five or 10. This relatively liberal group size limit gave British Columbians more leeway to exercise their freedoms of religion, speech and assembly.

Horgan's government moved quickly to resume surgeries cancelled in March and April, which would have led to a high grade in Life, Liberty & Security were it not for the hypocrisy of opting to use independent clinics to try to clear the backlog while continuing to deny suffering individuals the right to pay these clinics themselves.

Horgan gets a low mark on Democracy & the Rule of Law. His government did not meet during the worst three months of the crisis even though the province—particularly the capital Victoria—had extremely low levels of COVID-19. Upon the legislature's return, Horgan proposed a law to extend emergency orders up to one year after the state of emergency had ended, which is democratically questionable.

Horgan gets a C in Mobility Rights; although he did not impose unconstitutional border closures, he suggested people facing harassment due to their out-of-province license plates take the bus or ride a bike, which may have led to an Albertan man's truck window being smashed. Overall, he gets a B-.



---

# Doug Ford

## Ontario



Image: By [Andrew Scheer](#) (PD)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **C**

Assembly & Speech: **C**

Mobility Rights: **A**

Life, Liberty & Security: **C**

Privacy Rights: **D**

**Grade Average: C**

### Weak on Democracy, Rule of Law and Privacy Rights

Ontario's Progressive Conservative premier showed some respect for the constitution but gets low marks on Democracy & Rule of Law and Privacy Rights.

Although Ford allowed the legislature to hold him to account during the height of the crisis, he later supported Bill 195, which extended some emergency orders until after the emergency had ended. The law gives Ford too much power over collective agreements which is a threat to freedom of association. Ford also showed little respect for rule of law: he had a family gathering that exceeded his own five-person limit, and he visited his cottage while telling others not to do the same. He later suggested others who broke the rules should face \$100,000 fines.

Ford also showed little respect for privacy rights when he supported creating a database that allows first responders to access the names, birthdates and addresses of people who test positive for COVID-19. The database

has been nixed but not until after it was accessed 95,000 times.

Ford's grade on Life, Liberty & Security was helped by the fact that he protected the right of Ontarians to move freely throughout the province by refusing calls to close off parts of cottage country.

Ford's record on Assembly & Speech is mixed. He said that anti-lockdown protesters outside Queen's Park were "breaking the law" and he called them a "bunch of yahoos" despite their willingness to obey social distancing. He was less critical of later anti-racism protesters, suggesting he may have learned his lesson.

Ford did better in Religion & Conscience: after a pastor was fined with disobeying the gathering size limit, he created an exemption for safe parking lot services.

Ford gets an A on Mobility Rights because he refused to put up unconstitutional border controls. Overall, Ford gets a C.

---

# Stephen McNeil

## Nova Scotia



Image: By [USDA](#) (PD)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **B**

Assembly & Speech: **C**

Mobility Rights: **F**

Life, Liberty & Security: **D**

Privacy Rights: **F**

**Grade Average: D+**

### Fails on Mobility and Privacy Rights

Nova Scotia's outgoing Liberal premier showed little respect for the constitution during the crisis. McNeil set the tone in March when he said that "failure to follow public guidelines to limit the spread of COVID-19 puts our civil liberties at risk." In fact, it was McNeil who was putting liberties at risk.

McNeil gets an F in Mobility Rights because he walled off the province with checkpoints to keep fellow Canadians out, unless they were willing to quarantine. This may have been a violation of section 6 of the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, as well as the *Constitution Act, 1867*, which makes clear that only the federal government has the power to quarantine and regulate interprovincial trade.

Even after the border restrictions were eased, McNeil required provincial boundary crossers to share their addresses, phone numbers and names with peace officers while providing little comfort that privacy would be protected. This led to an F in privacy rights.

McNeil gets a D for Democracy & Rule of Law. His government renewed the state of emergency in July, despite the province having gone weeks without a confirmed local case. It also issued a questionable order to police that they crack down on people using beaches and parks. McNeil never provided a reasonable explanation for why restricting liberty by closing beaches and municipal parks was necessary, hurting his grade in Life, Liberty & Security. The park closures plus a ban on gatherings of five persons or more made it difficult for Nova Scotians to exercise their rights to free assembly and free expression, although McNeil did redeem himself somewhat by supporting the rights of anti-racism protesters who gathered in June.

McNeil's only good grade is in Freedom of Religion. He allowed faith organizations to gather 250 people together outdoors and up to 200 persons indoors, depending on capacity, after the outbreak was under control. Overall, McNeil gets a D+.

---

# Francois Legault

## Quebec



Image: By [LouisRoyQc](#) & modified (CC 4.0)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **F**

Assembly & Speech: **B**

Mobility Rights: **F**

Life, Liberty & Security: **D**

Privacy Rights: **D**

**Grade Average: D**

### **Fails on Mobility Rights and Freedom of Religion/Conscience**

Quebec's CAQ premier has a bad record on protecting constitutional rights during the pandemic. Legault did not pay much heed to freedom of religion rights, making no accommodations for churches, mosques and temples for more than three months. In fact, places of worship re-opened weeks after shopping malls and restaurants.

Legault's government also proposed a bill that would have allowed his cabinet to amend any "rule that is impractical or too onerous to apply in the circumstances arising from the pandemic." This was an undemocratic power grab. The wording of the bill was changed but Legault still pressed ahead with a law that would allow him to sideline the legislature on infrastructure project approvals after the emergency had ended.

Legault also gets a poor mark in Mobility Rights. He ignored section 6 of the *Charter* and the *Constitution Act, 1867* when he ordered police roadblocks at the provincial border. These roadblocks were also irrational considering that Quebec's neighbours faced a greater threat from Quebec residents than vice versa. Thankfully they've ended.

Legault also showed little respect for privacy rights. When Quebec City police had used cellphone geolocation data without a warrant to track and arrest a woman who had allegedly violated an order to self-isolate, Legault suggested he might direct the provincial police force to do the same. Overall, he gets a D+.

---

# Scott Moe

## Saskatchewan



Image: By Halsigne14 (PD)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **B**

Assembly & Speech: **B**

Mobility Rights: **A**

Life, Liberty & Security: **B**

Privacy Rights: **A**

**Grade Average: B**

### Tied with Manitoba's premier for best overall

The Saskatchewan Party premier ties Manitoba's premier for the highest overall grade, but he too gets a bad mark on the dimension of Democracy & Rule of Law. The legislature stopped sitting in March and Moe has refused the opposition leader's request to reconvene in September, suggesting that the NDP won't get an opportunity to hold the executive to account before the next election, which by law must occur on or before October 26.

Moe gets a B in Religion & Conscience. Although he capped indoor services at 10 people even where it was safe to have more, he defended safe parking lot services and eventually raised the capacity restrictions to 30 per cent of capacity or a maximum of 150 people.

Moe also gets a B on Assembly & Speech. He suggested that even if an anti-racism rally breached the gathering size limit of 10 people, the protesters had his support and law

enforcement had been right not to enforce that limit.

Moe gets an A on Mobility Rights because he rejected calls for unconstitutional border closures.

Moe gets a B on Life, Liberty & Security because thousands of surgeries were postponed and not quickly restarted. The province also continued to restrict some forms of liberty far too long by not allowing access to parks, beaches and playgrounds until June.

Moe gets an A on Privacy Rights because he carefully deliberated before supporting the release of certain details about COVID-19 positive patients that some feared would make it easy to determine who had been infected in small towns.

---

# Blaine Higgs

## New Brunswick



Image: By [New Brunswick](#) (PD)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **B**

Assembly & Speech: **B**

Mobility Rights: **F**

Life, Liberty & Security: **B**

Privacy Rights: **F**

**Grade Average: C-**

### Fails on Privacy Rights and Mobility Rights

New Brunswick's Progressive Conservative premier failed to protect the constitution in a number of ways.

Higgs sought undemocratic changes to the province's *Emergency Measures Act* that would have allowed cabinet to amend nearly all laws without the approval of the legislature. Known as a Henry VIII clause, the failed proposal was a major threat to the province's constitutional structure. The only reason that Higgs doesn't get an F on Democracy & Rule of Law is because he formed a sort of unity government with the opposition and the legislative assembly continued to meet.

The same bill proposed giving peace officers the power to do street checks, which hurt his chances of a good grade in Privacy Rights. What ended up flunking him on Privacy Rights was fact that the province set up an East German-style tip line so that members of the public could snitch on neighbours. This was especially disturbing considering there were

only a few dozen COVID-19 cases at the time. Higgs' government has also pressured restaurants and other social venues to track patrons to facilitate contact tracing, raising concerns by the NB Privacy Commissioner. Higgs also failed on Mobility Rights by putting up unconstitutional roadblocks at provincial borders.

Higgs did a bit better in Freedom of Religion. He didn't allow any form of religious gathering for several weeks, but he was among the first premiers to allow religious services to resume, on May 8.

Higgs did well on the dimension of Life, Liberty & Security, in part because he resisted calls to close municipal parks like his counterpart in Nova Scotia. Higgs also gets a good mark on Freedom of Assembly. Gathering sizes were initially limited to 10 but were raised at reasonable intervals and Higgs did not attempt to stop protests against racism or his mandatory vaccination bill that exceeded the gathering limit.

---

# Dennis King

## Prince Edward Island



Image: By PEI & modified (CC 2.0)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **D**

Religion & Conscience: **F**

Assembly & Speech: **B**

Mobility Rights: **F**

Life, Liberty & Security: **D**

Privacy Rights: **F**

**Grade Average: D**

### Fails on Life, Liberty and Security as well as Mobility/Privacy

Prince Edward Island's Progressive Conservative premier is near the bottom of the class.

He gets an F in Democracy & Rule of Law for attempting to change the province's *Emergency Measures Act* to create a Henry VIII clause that would have given his cabinet the power to suspend or alter laws without the approval of the legislature. He put forward this proposal after P.E.I.'s first wave—a few dozen cases—was already receding.

King's government gets an F for Freedom of Religion: most services were prevented by an onerous five person gathering limit that was in place until May 1. By June, things weren't much better with houses of worship limited to just 15 people even as restaurants could host up to 50. When challenged on the harsh restriction, King said it was in place because worshippers tend to be "an older type population." This suggests age discrimination.

King also gets a failing grade for impinging Mobility Rights by ordering police to patrol the Confederation Bridge and the Charlottetown Airport. His restrictions were so harsh that officers twice denied a resident entry because he had Ontario license plates on his vehicle.

The border checkpoints also led to a failing grade from a privacy perspective because the emergency order creating them said that police were allowed to demand private information and order members of the public to submit to "other examinations as may be required." That is so broad that it suggests police could arbitrarily demand residents undergo COVID-19 tests.

King's grade on Life, Liberty & Security was hurt by the fact that he took too long to offer a plan to catch up more than 1,100 postponed surgeries.



---

# Dwight Ball

## Newfoundland & Labrador



Image: By [Dover1958](#) & modified (CC 4.0)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **F**

Religion & Conscience: **F**

Assembly & Speech: **F**

Mobility Rights: **F**

Life, Liberty & Security: **F**

Privacy Rights: **F**

**Grade Average: F**

### **Worst overall and fails to respect the constitution at all**

Newfoundland & Labrador's Liberal premier, who has since left office, failed on every measure of respect for the constitution.

Ball rushed through changes to the province's *Public Health Protection and Promotion Act* that threatened to turn the province into a rogue police state. The changes included an unconstitutional provision that would allow a public health inspector to pull a person over in her car and demand to see what is on her phone, take "copies, extracts, photographs or videos" and force a swab up her nose or demand a blood sample without a warrant. Giving police this kind of power is a potential violation of privacy rights, rule of law, and liberty. The amendments also say that ministers can order police to "locate and detain" a person, imprison them, and then kick them out of the province without any recourse before a judge. That is a violation of rule of law and liberty.

Like the other Atlantic premiers, Ball imposed unconstitutional restrictions on mobility rights.

He trapped Newfoundlanders on the island by denying ferry access to those trying to use them to visit family and friends. He also put roadblocks on the Quebec-Labrador border that were still in place in June, and he oversaw an arbitrary system for deciding who could enter the province. That arbitrary system meant that a woman who grew up in Newfoundland but who lived in Nova Scotia—which had almost no COVID-19 cases—was kept from attending her mother's funeral while thousands of workers from higher-risk provinces like Alberta and Quebec were allowed in.

Ball also fails on Freedom of Religion: houses of worship were not allowed to open until June 25, even if they had enough space for social distancing. Ball attacked Assembly & Speech when he said that crab fishers who protested in May had engaged in an illegal gathering, claiming the "right to gather" is only available in "normal circumstances." Hopefully the new premier, Andrew Furey, does better.

---

# Justin Trudeau

## Canada



Image: By [Darren Fisher](#) (PD)

Democracy & Rule of Law: **F**

Assembly & Speech: **A**

Mobility Rights: **F**

Life, Liberty & Security: **A**

Privacy Rights: **A**

**Grade Average: C+**

### Fails on Democracy & Rule of Law

Our Liberal prime minister showed some respect for constitutional rights and freedoms, but he failed to uphold democratic norms and protect mobility rights.

Trudeau shut down Parliament in March and then resisted the creation of a safe, hybrid sitting of Parliament that would have allowed the legislative branch to fully hold his cabinet to account. Trudeau replaced much of question period with almost daily press briefings that were an undemocratic substitute. He also tried to give his minority government the power to tax and spend without parliamentary approval until 2022. Part of his cabinet's response was to award a multi-million-dollar contract to WE, a charity with financial ties to the Trudeau family. This prompted an investigation by the ethics watchdog. Just as committees were starting to investigate the scandal, Trudeau prorogued parliament.

Trudeau flunked at protecting mobility rights by placing excessively onerous restrictions on

Canadians who wished to leave or enter the country long after it was clear that Canadians could safely travel to and from Europe. Trudeau also failed to defend the division of powers from provincial premiers who encroached on federal powers by shutting their borders.

Trudeau did better when it came to free speech. He defended the right to protest, and in fact joined anti-racism protesters even though gathering size restrictions were in place. Trudeau also resisted calls for invasive contact tracing apps that would have tracked users' locations in favour of a voluntary app that uses Bluetooth and that stores records on users' phones.

Trudeau deserves praise for resisting the temptation to invoke the *Emergencies Act*, which would have threatened liberty by imposing possible jail sentences on those who did not comply with cabinet's emergency orders. Overall, Prime Minister Trudeau gets a C+.

---

## How local leaders did

**Some mayors supported indefensible restrictions on people's freedoms while others focused on providing their constituents with the tools they needed to stay safe. Here is a look at a few local leaders whose responses stood out to the CCF, for better or worse.**

### Toronto Mayor John Tory

Tory signed a bylaw requiring people from different households to stay two metres apart. He also closed High Park, leading to the arrest an 80-year-old woman who was just out foraging for greens. Tory then wagged his finger at people for gathering in Trinity Bellwoods Park while wearing his face mask down around his chin and without keeping two metres apart from those he was chastising.



Image: By [Harvey K](#) & mod. (CC 2.0)

### Kingston Mayor Bryan Paterson

This eastern Ontario mayor pushed Premier Ford to adopt a regional approach to re-opening, arguing that severe restrictions on liberty weren't justified in parts of the province where there were hardly any cases of COVID-19. The premier eventually came around to the idea, which led to fewer restrictions on rights and freedoms for millions.



Image: By [Queen's U](#) & mod. (CC 2.0)

### Winnipeg Mayor Brian Bowman

Bowman focused on educating the public about how to stay safe, rather than punishing people for going about their business. The city did not hand out a single ticket until May, and it still managed to keep COVID-19 levels low.



Image: By [2017 Canada Games](#) & mod. (CC 2.0)

---

# How local leaders did

## Ottawa Mayor Jim Watson

Mayor Watson supported an army of overzealous bylaw officers. Among those ticketed were a father who was kicking a ball around an empty park with his four-year-old son, and people who sat on a park benches. Mayor Watson failed to immediately end the city's absurd ban of window visits at long-term care homes. He then attended an anti-racism protest that attracted thousands, suggesting it was OK to break social distancing rules as long as it was for the right political cause.



Image: By [US Embassy Canada](#) (PD)

## Victoria Mayor Lisa Helps

Mayor Helps showed little concern for the rule of law or the rights of business owners with her proposal to seize hotels and hand them over to homeless people.



Image: By [Lisa Helps](#) & mod. (CC 2.0)

## Norfolk County Mayor Kristal Chopp

This Ontario mayor suggested that the Ontario Provincial Police put up roadblocks to keep non-locals out, which would have been an excessive infringement of liberty. She also showed little respect for the rule of law when she had her hair cut in front of TV cameras to protest the province's decision to continue banning personal care services in her region until a local outbreak was over.



Image: By [Norfolk County](#) & mod. (CC 2.0)

**The Canadian Constitution Foundation (CCF) is a registered charity, independent and non-partisan. We defend the constitutional rights and freedoms of Canadians in the courts of law and public opinion.**

Canadian Constitution Foundation  
6025—12 St SE, Suite 215  
Calgary, AB T2H 2K1

Charitable Number: 86617 6654 RR0001  
The CCF is also a 501(c)(3) public charity in the U.S.